

Village of Goodrich
Special Council Meeting
October 21, 2015
9:00am
Minutes

PRESENT: Horton, McCafferty, Morey, Vick, Baldwin, Administrator/Clerk Sidge, Deputy Clerk Sasser

ABSENT:

Meeting called to order by Baldwin at 9:07 a.m.

Public Comment

D McAbee – Feels that this is not a complete meeting without the other health care committee members in attendance.

R Saroli – Stated that he arranged the first meeting for the health care committee where a chairperson was appointed. He was never informed of another meeting and is still on the committee as he did not step down. The committee discussed getting information from the Village regarding health care followed by collecting more information from MML or the State to find what other communities have done. Calling the other communities for reasons they do or don't charge employees for benefits comparable to our size. Feels that it is unfair to tell an employee they will have an income reduction and sit down with employees and explain why they are having benefits taken away. Unsure how much data was collected from the committee as he was never informed.

C Beebe – Believes the committee did a good job with what little paperwork they could get their hands on. Doesn't feel like we should compare Goodrich to other municipalities and doesn't like the Public Act with an 80/20 split but everyone must do it. Stated that most municipalities that they compared didn't give \$2 raises and get another vacation day but only gave \$.40 to \$.50 an hour raises. Compared us to Atlas employees who getting no benefits, no health care and only 5 vacation days but maybe misquoted a little bit. Some municipalities she was in contact with only provided health care to Administrators or Supervisors. Employees should appreciate the public and council for what we have given them. Wondered why employees were given different dollar amounts of coverage. Professionals everywhere are losing benefits and we should too. Thinks another meeting is needed because the other committee members should be present.

J Sidge – Wondered how many people Beebe listed are getting retirement after they walk out the door as Goodrich employees don't? Sidge receives 8% retirement because she is "the boss", Traci's is 5%, employees upstairs is 3% verses Atlas Township's 15% along with \$4,800 a year for not taking medical insurance that they never had. How many municipalities receive health care when they no longer work there? It makes a difference comparing all elements because we need to save more for our retirements because we get a small percent deposited into a 401K. The amount the committee is asking to charge her is almost \$400 a month. If council charges all the employees 20% the total amount of savings is only \$12,000 a year so please explain what the

employees are doing wrong over the 10, 15, 20, 25 & 28 years of service we have provided to the community. There is over \$300,000 in fund balance so why this would be needed? Not enough questions were asked to the communities that we were compared to because the staff for the Village all have many hats we wear.

C Beebe – Other communities have multiple jobs as well. A lawsuit with no insurance, a drain project in the spring and a dam that will need every dollar we can save now.

E Campbell – Understands that the residents want to save money but you need to look at the people that work here. He stated that he has worked for the Village for 20 years. GM workers he knows get 100% health care paid for currently. Wife is at Beaumont Hospital right now because she just had brain surgery on Monday for a tumor. Unsure of the outcome of her recovery a \$3,000 health care bill will be a big hit for their income. Is a Union needed to represent and protect the employees?

M Baldwin – Heart goes out to Mr. Campbell and his family.

K Vick – Stated that the Union her family is in they have to pay over 25% and that is typical. The employees will never earn the respect from the public until they understand that they are all facing the same insurance issues with our own sob stories and cancer issues. It's not about ripping things away from the employees or being disrespectful but it is about nobody should be getting 100% health benefits on taxpayers money.

T Sasser – Village employees do not receive health benefits after we retire whereas a lot of places do.

R Saroli – Said that this 80/20 split should not be a competition with other municipalities. He would like council to see the reports and the data to back the findings of the committee. Every element should be compared with wages, benefits, etc. The average autoworker makes \$28 an hour which doesn't compare to what our employees make.

K Vick – As far as retirement goes, where do employees start out at? They should be \$10-\$12 an hour and we are starting them at \$18 an hour which is far too high for this type of job. This isn't the type of job that you are supposed to be a lifer at and this is why the community doesn't have any respect for the employees because they have no respect for the community.

P Wartella – Has been concerned for months about the PA152 which can be found on the Michigan.gov website. Would like to see Mr. Saroli's information if he is on the committee. School employees, state employees and union workers all implemented the act for either the 80/20 split or a hard cap. She feels that the committee put a lot of work into their decisions.

M Mayne – Stated that Atlas Township opts to not take health insurance. If council decides to make employees pay for insurance maybe they could ease into the payments so it isn't such a big hit for the employees' paychecks.

J Sidge – Clarification to Mrs. Wartellas PA152 the Village has three different options whereas the third one that wasn't mentioned was to opt out and charge upon the discretions of the council. 1,100 unites of government, including The Village, doesn't qualify for the money she is referring to and can't ever.

M Baldwin – Thanked the committee for their work.

P Morey – Stated that we are paying 3 mills for the police department and out of those 1.5 mills are for benefits. The average officer is paid \$60,000 along with benefits of \$60,000 a year. After 20 years the officers retire with all their benefits and move on to other jobs working for twenty something an hour. Our average employee gets about 4% and Atlas gets 15% in retirement. Atlas employees rolled \$4,800 in health care money into their salary and receive 15% on top of it for retirement. The police are not writing speeding tickets in Goodrich but are writing many warnings. He feels that it's shameful that the employees only receive 4% in retirement.

J Vick – Needed clarification on all the employees combined paying 20% would save the village \$12,000 a year. Stated that the purpose of PA152 is to keep from what happened before with our president and administrator got their own insurance without taking it to the council behind closed doors. Very little information was given to council to make decisions such as health care and should have been provided. He believes that we will have to raise our mills because of our deficit spending along with cutting health care and other things. He also feels that the employees should not be at the meeting to intimidate council with union or health issues. Stated that anytime you try to organize a union you are provided fewer benefits and fewer wages and took it as a threat for bringing it up. Also mentioned in 2005 when he had cancer he was paying 23% of health care so yeah life sucks.

M Baldwin – Stated that he allowed the employees to be at the meeting because it affects them.

S McCafferty – Wanted to state that as a taxpayer she understands the idea of saving money by charging employees. If her benefits were being discussed to be taken away she too would be in the audience like the employees. She feels maybe a compromise could happen but 20% is too high of a hit for the employees to endure.

R Horton – Stated that if an American doesn't have health insurance the cost to the government for a single person will be \$650. Feels there is nothing wrong with the current Blue Cross policy the Village has. If the cost is the issue, the policy can be revisited and altered to make it cost less for the Village with higher co-pays and deductibles for the employees.

S McCafferty – Wondered when rates for the Affordable Health Care Act are available.

R Horton – Answered McCafferty's question regarding the Affordable Health Care Act with November being the answer.

J Vick – Wondered why there is different payment amounts for each employees? We should have one insurance policy and everyone pays the same.

R Horton – Answered Vick’s questions regarding the amounts being different because there are different rates for each situation such as children, age, marriage, single, etc.

J Vick – Asked if it was because there are only five employees and not a group plan?

R Horton – Stated again that rates are different per employees’ situation in life.

J Vick – Compared his insurance coverage at work to Village coverage by saying everyone gets the same coverage no matter how long they worked for the company.

R Horton – Clarified again that this difference is due to the rate per employee.

J Sidge – Stated that the Village insurance payment went down almost 4% this year compared to last year. She also stated that the procedure for the Village is and has always been that she works with the President of the Council collecting information and they decide on which policy is given to council to adopt for the employees insurance benefits.

M Baldwin – He made mention that insurance laws have changed in the last few years which was much easier to deal with.

J Vick – Wondered about getting a group rate?

M Baldwin – Stated that this is a complicated topic and needs lots of research. He feels disappointed that no councilmembers came into the office to ask questions or requested information. And wondered about getting a group plan for the Village?

R Horton – Stated again that we do have a group plan, not an individual policy for employees and the rates are just different because of age, family, etc.

J Vick – Disagreed with Horton by stating we don’t have a group plan for the Village. Stated that we were aware of this at budget time and wondered why we are just now working on this when it expires on December 1, 2015. Wondered why they are always presented with the minimum information and feels there is no transparency in this process.

J Sidge – Stated that if Vick had questions he should have come into the office and asked questions.

J Vick – Disagreed with Sidge and stated the information should already be given to council.

J Sidge – Clarified that this meeting was set up for the findings of the Health Committee, not the information that she has researched.

J Vick – Wanted the findings of the committee made public.

M Baldwin – Employees should pay 20% of their health care is what the committee is suggesting.

J Sidge – Suggested that another meeting be set up with the insurance representative present.

M Baldwin – Agrees that another meeting is needed with more data.

R Horton – Believes that costs are down and employees shouldn't be paying big deductibles. Thinks a representative present at the next meeting is a good idea.

J Vick – Wondered if the consensus of the council is to agree with the committees results.

M Baldwin – Stated that more information is needed to make a decision.

Special Council Meeting set for Wednesday, November 4, 2015 at 6:00pm

Public Comment

P Wartella – Reminded the council that the taxpayers elected them into office and they work for them. Bottom line is money and there are many issues that are going to need payments soon. An insurance representative is a salesperson and the information should have already been given to council.

R Saroli – Wondered if you are looking for a new provider and you already have an existing condition are the premiums more costly?

R Horton – Explained that normally the rates are figured with family, age, etc., not existing health conditions.

C Beebe – Stated that Goodrich teachers have gone from \$500 deductibles to \$2300-\$2600 deductibles for families with no prescription coverage. Health care is serious and everyone is paying for it in the real world. She also suggested that we look into a different agent.

K Vick – Felt that before the meeting the staff should have had different agents to compare different insurance plans.

J Sidge – Stated that Vick is making statements about her that need to stop. She has no idea what information has been collected and she is misspeaking again.

K Vick – Feels that Sidge was being insubordinate and Baldwin has to keep the meeting in order. Stated that she never specifically said Sidge's name in her last statement and only referred to the staff.

P Morey – Explained that the salt spreader needs to be welded onto the truck and needs a motion to have this done not to exceed \$740 for 12 hours' worth of work as our usual welder doesn't currently have time available.

J Vick – Wondered why the installation wasn't part of the price of the equipment?

P Morey – Stated that the Villages regular welder usually handles these kinds of things for a fraction of the price. He just doesn't have time before winter.

J Vick – Doesn't understand what Morey is asking for. Feels that we need three bids and we need to table this until we have them.

E Campbell – Stated that this is a Monroe spreader and the closest location is near Ohio. DPW's are not welders or the equipment and this needs to be done before winter.

Members of the council and audience jump into conversation. Too many people talking at once to decipher who said what.

J Vick – Wondered if we are worried about the warrantee and if that is the reason we want that company we bought it from to do the work?

M Baldwin – Stated that we need bids before we make any decision and table until the next council meeting.

Motion to Adjourn by Baldwin, seconded by Morey.
All present in affirmative. Motion carried.

Meeting adjourned at 10:33 am

Respectfully Submitted,

Traci Sasser, Deputy Clerk
Village of Goodrich